



## Comment on suggestion 7

Darren McSweeney

7 pages

## Comments on Suggestions

SI Graham Hall, S2 Russell & Genevieve Stewart, S3 Vaughan Paul Angel, S4 Jean Hall, S5 Adam Harradine, S6 Ian Pickering, S9 Moore Park Beach Assoc., S14 Bev & Mike McAulay and S17 Cr Jason Bartells

These suggestions all propose or request that the Moore Park Beach community, along with other communities in the vicinity be reunited with the remainder of the Bundaberg township. I agree with these proposals and believe that major regional towns and cities should be united within one division where possible. My suggestion unites this community with Bundaberg in Hinkler.

## S8 Fraser Coast Regional Council.

The Council wishes for their entire area to be within the one division. Unfortunately, I don't believe that it is possible to accommodate at this time. The population and area of the Council is too large and – with other large townships at both the northern (Bundaberg) and southern (Gympie) boundaries of Wide Bay, it would require a significant reworking of all divisions in the area for what would result is limited improvement in community of interest.

#### S11 Andrew Kamler

By using complete SA2 regions as the smallest entities, Mr Kamler has created far greater changes than is necessary.

Mr Kamler states that Kennedy and Leichhardt will need to be addressed sometime soon. However, I feel that the time is right to make significant and needed changes at this redistribution.

Most of the changes Mr Kamler suggests for inner Brisbane are wholly unnecessary. There is no need whatsoever for a division to swap banks of the river entirely. There is actually no need for any division to cross the river. Mr Kamler is effectively suggesting abolishing Griffith, renaming Bonner as Griffith, Lilley as Bonner and creating a new division named Lilley in the middle of the northern suburbs. These changes are not needed.

Remarkably, the changes suggested in the Gold Coast and for Wright make some sense, although I dislike the fact that Fadden stretches so far north in to parts of Logan, which has been made necessary by so many radical changes within Brisbane.

## S23, Dean Ashley

I agree with the principles applied in rural areas by Mr Ashley, except that he supports the continued split of Cairns. Most of the other rural divisions are acceptable, although Hinkler could surely take more of the northern communities in Bundaberg. The changes to Kennedy,

however make Maranoa very large. Transferring Clifton from Groom rather than Pittsworth or Oakey seems less sensible, as this is the furthest township from most of Maranoa. Unfortunately, the broken division of Wright remains unchanged, this is not acceptable in its current form. I feel that Acacia Ridge does not belong as part of Oxley as it is effectively separated from the rest of the division by open green zones and industrial estates with few lines of communication or networks.

### S21, Sean Lender

Mr Lender suggests some minor changes in Logan and the Gold Coast which are acceptable and could be accommodated, but these changes would certainly need to be considered as part of the bigger picture.

## S24 Jan McNamara

Ms McNamara's suggestion for a Mount Isa – Townsville based division has merit as a concept, and would certainly be a distinct community sharing common interests, however the numbers make it impossible. The proposal is far too big for one division, yet too small for two. Splitting part of urban Townsville out may be a possibility, but would lead to significant changes elsewhere. It also appears that the area left to the north would be far too small to accommodate both Leichhardt and Kennedy.

#### S15 Bob Richardson

I can understand that Mr Richardson advocates strongly for Leichhardt to remain as is, and clearly this is the area he is focussed on in his suggestion. While there is a certain community of interest between those electors in Cape York with Cairns, I suggest that surely the actual suburbs of the city of Cairns have a greater connection

with Cairns than those areas more remote. This is the same argument that I mentioned in my suggestion for placing Palm Islands within Kennedy.

The most obvious single community of interest is a single town, suburb or city and ideally every town, suburb or city would be wholly contained within the same division. My goal is to ensure that local suburbs of the regional cities that can accommodate it, be united within one division. My proposal to create a Cairns based Leichhardt achieves this, continuing, and further increasing the split of urban communities from their town or city centre clearly does not.

Elsewhere in Mr Richardson's proposal, he abolishes Flynn and creates a new division named Riordan. I believe these changes are unnecessary and do not improve communities of interest. The proposed Riordan is unwieldly stretching from the eastern Townsville suburbs and the Whitsundays Municipality, through the Isaac Municipality to Longreach and the NT border at Boulia. These areas have very little in common, and there are few means of communication between the outback regions and the coast.

Mr Richardson's proposal to place the Sunshine Coast and hinterland areas into Hinkler, wrapped around and extended Wide Bay through to a narrow passage at Bundaberg also fails to serve community of interest. There is no way that places like Maleny and Esk are more aligned with Bundaberg than the Sunshine Coast, Fraser Coast, Caboolture, Ipswich, or even Brisbane.

#### S18 Bob Katter

Naturally, Hon Mr Katter will want to retain much of the essence of his current division. In reality, my proposal aligns with his claim ..."to minimise any geographic growth size of the Kennedy electorate". My suggested Kennedy reduces size of the division from its current 570,268 km² to a mere 383,080 km².

I also believe that by shifting Leichhardt to become a Cairns-based division, it improves the community of interest for Kennedy. Kennedy as it is now is not a distinct cohesive entity or a single community of interest, but rather, it is made of many separate communities. Mt Isa is a long way from Ingham both geographically and demographically, and Ingham is different to Charters Towers which is different to the suburb of Julago in Townsville.

## S10 Jeff Waddell

Mr Waddell again delivers a thorough and comprehensive analysis of his suggestion. His proposed Wright is not unlike something that I was considering for a while in my deliberations, but ultimately decided that it would be unlikely to garner support. There is certainly logic to the proposal, and I applaud his boldness. These changes, however cause Fadden to take up a significant portion of the former Wright, which does not appear to sit as well with the rest of the division.

I am happy with the alignment of Ryan and Brisbane, and believe these changes would – so far as they do not affect other divisions – be preferable to my original suggestion in this area. While moving Sandgate, Brighton and Deagon out of Lilley appears to be a logical solution on paper, I know this change was loudly objected to in 2009 and I would be hesitant to suggest the change again. I am not keen on his proposal for Fisher to cross into the Moreton Bay municipality, although placing D'Aguilar and Woodford is probably preferable to Elimbah.

Much like my proposal, Mr Waddell proposes almost identical Dawson, Leichhardt and Herbert divisions, and sees the need to unite major regional towns together as an imperative. Changes to Kennedy and Leichhardt flow on to make Maranoa very large, however the excessive size is somewhat mitigated by changes to Groom and Wright, which places the southern boundaries further to the west than previously. While his changes to Wide Bay seem to be reasonable, they do have flow on effects to Hinkler, which becomes considerably larger and somewhat fractured.

#### Sll Martin Gordon

As always, I appreciate the efforts of Mr Gordon, even if his suggestion is considerably different from my own. His minor change in Dickson will leave a small portion of electors from Brisbane City separated from the rest of the community. I would prefer more extensive transfers in this area, to maintain a more even split.

His changes proposed for Wide Bay, Hinkler, Flynn and Fairfax are meritorious and I considered similar proposals as part of my suggestion but ultimately opted against

this, focussing on uniting the regional towns. As with Mr Waddell, his proposal for Fisher to cross into the Moreton Bay municipality is something I felt is not required.

With the changes proposed to Oxley and Moreton, Algester fits with the eastern suburbs of the proposed Oxley, however his proposed Oxley would be split by a large green zone in Willawong and Pallara. I would prefer to see more changes in the rural north, especially within Townsville, however, I do know Mr Gordon has attempted to make significant changes in the past to no avail. I note that he proposes placing some of Charters Towers Municipality in Capricornia, as I do which will probably, but should not, be contentious,

#### S12 Dr Mark Mulcair

Dr Mulcair has opted for a minimalist review and though I am somewhat disappointed that he chose to retain Far North Queensland in much of its existing alignment, I certainly understand the reasons he would choose to do so, and his suggestion explains that more radical changes have been met with resistance in the past. I can only reiterate my own opinion that keeping regional towns together as single communities of interest should outweigh other more tenuous community of interest claims.

I am pleased to see his proposal for Capricornia unites Rockhampton, however his proposed Flynn covers a considerably large swathe of land from South Burnett to Isaac Municipalities while being focussed on Gladstone. Again, his proposal pushes Fisher south, which I think can be avoided. Most of his suggestions in the south of Brisbane are logical and make sense, I do particularly like the use of Oxley Creek as a clean, strong boundary between Moreton and Oxley.

#### S21 Mark Yore

Mr Yore's proposals within the Gold Coast are reasonable, and warrant consideration. While moving the Lockyer Valley into Groom looks logical on paper, the Lockyer Valley and Toowoomba on the escarpment are quite distinct areas, although the different is minimised by transferring the more mountainous regions only. The remaining southern Brisbane divisions appear to be logical changes and make sense. His proposal for Blair is interesting, however I am not sure how much it would meet community of interest grounds.

I am pleased to see his proposed Leichhardt almost reflects my own with a Cairns-based division excluding Cape York. Unfortunately, this is not continued south and he does not excise all of Dawson from Townsville. I also support the change to bring Kingaroy into Flynn, where it fits neatly with the nearby townships such as Gayndah as in my suggestion.

## S25 Pirate Party Australia

I was genuinely surprised to see a submission prepared by the Pirate Party, mostly because I know minor parties such as this one would have very limited resources to afford to dedicate to such a task as a redistribution. However, I was less surprised to see that most of the transfers proposed are minor and simply reflect changes to adjust the existing divisions and bring all divisions within tolerance. There are few remarkable considerations within their proposal.

# Major Party Submissions S16 Liberal National Party, S19 Queensland Greens, S22 Australian Labor Party

Obviously, these submissions are designed to enhance their respective parties' chances of election, while mitigating those of their opponents. There are some odd changes proposed, and some notable lack of changes proposed in some areas. Some of the most peculiar suggestions are provided by the major parties.

The ridiculous proposal for Flynn from the Liberal National Party, stretching to the Northern Territory border from the coast at Gladstone. In addition, dramatically increasing Kennedy, taking in all of Cape York, but also still expanding southwards into Collinsville.

The Queensland Greens push Capricornia into southern Townsville, splitting the city across four divisions now (Dawson, Capricornia and Kennedy in addition to Herbert). They also push Blair across the Brisbane River and, in turn, send Ryan into Moreton Bay Municipality which pushes Dickson across the Bruce Highway into Deception Bay. They also make a series of swaps between Groom and Maranoa around Crows Nest, apparently swapping one meaningless series of lines for a different series of meaningless lines, with for all intents and purposes, no discernible effect.

The Labor Party push Hinkler down to take in parts of the hinterland around Maryborough (but not the town itself) and attempt to pull part of Mitchelton into Brisbane from Ryan creating an awkward panhandle in Brisbane. Their submission advocates splitting Wright even further by carving a hole through the centre, Forde stretches down into Scenic Rim Municipality as far as Jimboomba.

It is particularly interesting to see both LNP and ALP propose a very similar transfer between Dickson and Lilley. This transfer obviously increases the chances of both parties retaining their existing seats simultaneously, so any community of interest language used in the submissions here should definitely be disregarded as cover for the electoral gains.

## Summary

I sincerely home that the Redistribution Committee has the confidence to make real and necessary improvements to the existing divisions, rather than tweaking the edges. As Mr Waddell is firm in pursuing, the Commonwealth Electoral Act stipulates that the community of interest considerations should be superior to the existing boundaries. Where there is a genuine need to change the boundaries, the Committee should not be afraid to make the necessary adjustments, as dramatic as they may be, and enhance the electoral representation of all Queenslanders.

The changes within the Brisbane metropolitan area, Ipswich and the Gold and Sunshine Coasts do not need to be as significant. There are already strong communities of interest represented in these areas.

I strongly believe that changes are needed to the rural divisions, and that the major regional towns and cities of Cairns, Townsville, Mackay, Rockhampton, Gladstone and Bundaberg deserve sufficient representation, with a division focussed on their unique and specific needs. A resident in a suburb of a major regional city should not have to travel over 200 kilometres to the next major regional town to visit their local member's office. Any division that splits major regional towns and cities fails to meet community of interest grounds and must be changed.